

Town of Cape Elizabeth  
Fort Williams Advisory Commission  
Meeting Minutes (Approved)  
January 15,2009

**Present:** Dan Chase (Chair), Greg Altnauer, Bill Brownell, Frank Butterworth, Maureen McCarthy, Bill Nickerson, Chuck Wilson

**Also:** Joe Edgar, Fort Williams Charitable Foundation

**Staff:** Bob Malley

**Consultants:** Rick Renner, Paul Becker

**Call to order:** Meeting called to order by Dan Chase at 7:05 in me Public Works Conference Room

Before beginning the formal agenda. Chairman Dan Chase recognized outgoing Chairman, Chuck Wilson for his service as Chairman of the Commission, and stated the Commission will be calling upon Chuck in the future to represent the FWAC.

**Minutes:**

Upon motion by Chuck Wilson, seconded by Greg Altnauer, minutes of the December 18th meeting were unanimously approved, with slight corrections.

**Park Update:**

Bob stated that with the abundant snow we have been receiving, there is a lot of sliding activity at the Fort. The only problems arise when the snow stops falling late and people show up early to slide. Such circumstances make it more difficult to complete the necessary plowing.

**Budget Status of Fort Williams Park Projects**

Bob distributed an updated budget summary as of January 15th for the projects currently being worked on by consultants engaged by the Commission.

Bleachers: The bleacher study is on budget. Samplings of existing bleacher materials have been completed, and alternative proposals for consideration have been provided by the consultants. Options were outlined in the minutes of the December 18th meeting. As of the date of the report, \$12,487 of the \$21,000 allocated for this project have been spent. During discussion, the consensus of the Commission was that it now has enough information to make recommendations about the bleachers. No more money should be spent for additional planning, but

the consultants should be asked to provide a summary report to document their findings for future reference.

Goddard Mansion: To date the consultants have made various recommendations for the Commission to consider. At the last meeting the Commission asked the consultants to further refine these recommendations, which are outlined below. As of January 15th, the amount expended exceeded the \$15,000 allocated by \$1,605. No work on the structure has been undertaken. During discussion, members concluded that with options to be presented by the consultants later in this meeting, we now have sufficient information to formulate recommendations about the mansion. No additional money should be spent, other than to have the consultants provide a summary report to document their findings for future reference.

Interpretive Displays: As of January 15th, \$22,176 of the \$34,000 allocated for the project (including \$9,000 from the Charitable Foundation) had been spent. Bob recommends we relocate the compass rose, but do minimal landscaping around the displays at this time. He has asked consultant Rick Renner to get back to him with a cost to complete the work.

Battery Studies: The least amount of attention has been given to these. As of the report date, \$10,771 of the \$35,000 allocated has been expended.

Main Entrance: Redesign and construction of the main Entrance has been substantially completed. To date, the amount expended of \$148,495 exceeds the \$133,215 allocated by \$15,280. There are a variety of reasons for this:

The bid of \$124,800 came in well above the engineer's estimate of \$106,945.

The bids were opened Sept. 11th, and the job was to be completed before the onset of winter. This resulted in a compressed time frame for the work to be completed.

Four separate contractors were engaged for the work (sitework, stonewall, fence and electrical) which complicated supervision of the project.

The engineer's fee of \$21,597 was more than anticipated. Some of the excess was due to materials prepared for the presentation made to the Town Council, and an additional \$5,438 was billed to this project, but should have been billed to other projects.

The excess costs will be covered from the Fort's capital fund balance, which currently stands at \$73,000. At this time lights will not be installed on the tops of the entrance columns due to the cost of \$2,000 per fixture plus the cost of installation.

Members of the Commission agreed that the main entrance looks wonderful and many positive comments have been heard from Town residents.

Given the difficult economic times. Bob expects we may see some revenue sources reduced in the coming year. These include such things as photo shoots, weddings and picnic shelter activities. On the other hand, \$4,000 of unexpected income was received from Beach to Beacon organizers.

The Public Works department is working to correct structural deficiencies at battery Keys. The cost will be in the range of \$500. In the process, the top of the battery will be sealed off from public access. Bob indicated he will need to consult periodically with engineer, Paul Becker, regarding necessary repairs.

#### Goddard Mansion Scope and Cost Options:

In response to feedback from the Commission in December, consultants Richard Renner and Paul Becker presented a more detailed breakdown of several options they presented at that meeting. This was done to provide the Commission with less expensive alternatives to consider in the immediate future.

These options are outlined as follows:

1. Do nothing immediately to stabilize or preserve the building. In the interest of public safety, a fence would be installed surrounding the structure at a safe distance to avoid personal injury to park visitors from falling debris. Estimated cost - \$10,000. It was estimated the life of the building in its current state could be 15 to 20 years.
2. Demolish the entire ruin, salvaging masonry elements for resale. Estimated cost - \$65,000, which does not recognize any value from the sale of materials.
3. Install fence at the Main House and the connector to the Carriage House to protect the public. Repair critical areas of the Carriage House which would allow the public to approach the structure, but not enter it. Repairs to the Carriage House would be to the parapets and chimney caps as well as removal of steel and wood imbedments. This leaves open the opportunity for continued preservation of all or part of the structure in the future. Estimated cost - \$25,000.
4. Complete emergency repairs to stabilize the most dangerous areas of the entire structure. This would allow the public to approach the building, but not enter it. Existing fencing within windows and doors would remain. This leaves open the option for further preservation in the future. Estimated cost -

\$65,000. The estimated life expectancy of the building under this option would be 25 - 30 years, plus annual maintenance expenses.

5. Complete full repairs to the Carriage House and Tower to preserve these elements for the long term. Demolish the balance of the building down to within 24" to 30" of the ground. Retain the door frame at the Main House. The public would be able to enter the Carriage House. Estimated cost - \$280,500. A consideration related to this option is that the Tower and the Carriage House have "intrinsic stability", meaning they do not need preservation of the Main House in order to be structurally sound.
6. Do the same as #5 above, but add interpretive signage and construct a picnic shelter in the Carriage House. Total estimated cost - \$411,034. If a roof is to be built on the Carriage House, it should be obviously differentiated from the original building. It could be constructed below the existing wall height so the roof would not be visible to those standing outside the building.

Annual maintenance costs for options 4,5 and 6 were estimated to be about \$5,000 per year. All of the above cost estimates include a 15 - 20 overhead and profit as well as a 15 contingency.

After the consultants' presentation, there was a vigorous discussion among Commission members about individual preferences. These ranged from preserving the entire structure in its current form which the consultants have said would cost \$631,000, if completed all at once, to demolishing the structure as describe in #2 above. Members agreed that we have no real sense as to the public sentiment concerning the Goddard Mansion, and to recommend demolishing the structure without public input would not be appropriate. On the other hand, the Town is in an extremely tight budget squeeze, and given financial restraints, only minimal funding would be available from the Town at this time.

In the end, a motion was made by Bill Nickerson, seconded by Bill Brownell, to recommend option #3 with a vision to preserving a portion of the mansion, at least the Carriage House, and solicit public input regarding preservation or demolition of the remaining structure.

Motion unanimously approved.

**Bleachers:**

After brief discussion a motion was made by Chuck Wilson, seconded by Maureen McCarthy, that no money be spent on the bleachers at this time, while requesting the Public Works Department to maintain them so as to avoid public safety hazards.

Motion approved: 6 for, 1 against.

**Battery Studies:**

Motion made by Chuck Wilson, seconded by Greg Altnauer, to create a subcommittee made up of Advisory Committee and Charitable Foundation members to search for grants to do research and planning as to how Battery Blair could be resurrected in an historically meaningful manner.

Motion unanimously approved.

Chuck volunteered to chair the subcommittee and Maureen volunteered to serve as a member.

**Interpretive Display:**

Bob informed the Commission that final cost figures will be available next month.

**Other Business:**

There was discussion relating to submission of a report to the Town Council containing recommendations concerning the Goddard Mansion. Dan, in consultation with others, will draft the report for consideration by the Commission at its next meeting.

Since the next meeting of the Commission is scheduled for February 19th, which falls during school vacation, it was decided to reschedule the meeting for February 12th.

Adjourned: 9:40